



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

***Representation of Issues of Tribal Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
in Mashaal Radio, Radio Pakistan and Deewa Radio.***

Mr. Danish Baber

PhD Scholar,

Department of Journalism & Mass Communication,
University of Peshawar.

Danish.baber@gmail.com

Abstract

This research study aims to investigate the issues of tribal districts of Pakistan in the three leading radio stations of Pakistan, including two foreign radio stations – Mashaal Radio and Deewa Radio, and one national broadcaster of Pakistan (Radio Pakistan). The fundamental research question answered in the study is: How the three selected radio stations covered the issues of tribal districts of Pakistan in their news bulletins? This fundamental research question has been supplemented with some additional research questions. The basic aim is to understand what issues of the tribal districts were emphasized by these three selected radio stations and what was ignored or less emphasized. The news bulletins of the three selected radio stations were studied from the 20th of December 2017 to the 20th of January 2018. The researcher relied on content analysis to answer all the outstanding research questions of this research study. It is significant to mention that the two selected international broadcasters were banned/suspended by the Pakistani government for propagating anti-Pakistan narratives to their listeners in the tribal districts and Afghanistan. The findings, based on the analysis of 657 news stories and informed by the Framing theory, reveal that all three selected radio stations failed to cover the issues of tribal districts independently and impartially as they favoured their respective governments in the coverage and thus deprived the people



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
of Tribal districts and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa of a rational and holistic debate surrounding their problems. Furthermore, the findings also support that Mashaal Radio was critical of the Pakistani government in their coverage - compared to Deewa Radio which tried to keep the balance.

Keywords: Pakistan, Tribal area, Deewa Radio, Radio Pakistan, News stories, War on terror

Introduction

Radio is the main and furthestmost consumed source of information in the tribal districts of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan. According to the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS), the population of Tribal districts stands at five million (PBS, 2020). According to the FATA Communications Strategy (FCS) report issued in 2015, over 80 percent of males and over 70 percent of females in the tribal districts frequently listen to the radio. No newspaper or magazine is published in the tribal districts because the colonial era law called Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR), which was recently changed, did not allow news media outlets in tribal areas. FCR was considered as a black law implemented by the British imperialist government back in 1901 in the tribal areas. In 2018 after the 31st amendment to the constitution of Pakistan, the tribal areas were merged into Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province. They showed they are liable to enjoy the same rules and regulations that the people of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa observe (Shah et al., 2019). Because of the low literacy rate, newspapers



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
published in cities have minimal circulation in the districts bordering Afghanistan. Watching Television is an expensive proposition – both in terms of affordability and because extremists in the region discouraged it for being ‘anti-Islam’ (Saeed, 2016). Another big reason which leaves radio as the primary medium of information for the local people is the unavailability or shortage of electricity in the tribal districts (Ullah, 2018). Therefore, it is necessary to create media space and radio-based information for locals of FATA to help them join the mainstream Pakistani media space and benefit from it.

While reporting terrorism, war and violent events, every media organization follow its own gatekeeping process for selecting and framing the news items. But the studies show that the agenda of a national or local news organization is different from that of international organizations (FRC, 2016). This study is designed to analyse the content of two international radio stations, **Mashaal** and **Deewa** and one national radio station **Radio Pakistan** that how they report and present the issues related to erstwhile FATA in their news bulletins. This research study aims to find out the discussion surrounding different themes in those news bulletins.



Literature review

Staples (1998) claims that radio is one of the most important sources of information that broadcasts information across different frontiers regardless of geographical locations. The reason for its popularity among the people lies in the fact that it could generate dialogue and provide a way to people to participate in and discuss local issues. Perhaps these reasons also make radio an essential medium of communication and research in developing countries. Researchers claim that it is considered an essential part of our daily lives as it could communicate messages to us even when we are walking, working or busy in any play. In the United States, it is estimated that the average listenership of radio is more than three hours a day. Many believe that if managed professionally it could influence the opinion of the people.

Paul (2022) believes that globally 75% of people listen to the radio on daily basis and if the given opportunity of exposing people to the quality content, then it can also bring a positive change in this regard – provided that the content fulfils the need of the listeners. In a developing country like Pakistan, it becomes essential that radio should be utilized in the right way to fulfil the needs of the people to bring positive change in the community.



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

Madamombe (2005) also endorses that the countries with the low literacy rate, excessive power cuts, and worst financial conditions, consider radio as an effective tool of communication. It could be used to make an effective change in people's lives. The above discussion seems so relevant in the context of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Tribal districts where all the above-mentioned issues prevail.

Different researchers claim that different radio stations on-air have different developmental programs including debating cultural issues, human rights violations, farming, use of technology, peace initiatives, health campaigns, social norms, democracy, religious issues and global warming etc. In such programs, on one hand, the experts share their opinion about the issues but, on the other hand, it also provides a way to the listeners to participate in different programs. The news bulletins and the different other programs are produced in the local and foreign languages, and thus it also increases the relevancy of radio and also its effectiveness (Ocwich, 2006).

Dash (2007) claims that time, place and location play an important role in effective broadcasting. It means broadcasting information in the strategic time, and in the strategic place and location carries more weightage over the others. The same stands true for the three selected



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

radio stations too where they used to broadcast news and other programs in a highly strategic time (War on Terror) and from strategic locations (Peshawar, Washington and Prague) and about strategic places (tribal districts).

Venkatalakshmi & Chandraleka (2013) also claim that for social change it is essential that both the government and non-government organizations should rely on the proper utilization of radio as a medium of communication. They believe that it is almost impossible to bring a change in society without communication. Thus, it is important that people should be exposed to the narratives that the state wants to establish in a particular society or community. Similarly, Forde et al. (2001) claim that in community broadcasting news and current affairs programs are integral parts of community broadcasting that inform the community about their surroundings – especially during any disaster, pandemic, or calamity. They also educate the listeners in this regard that what should they do, avoid or take care of during the crisis.

Jumani and Rahman (2009), while surveying respondents in Sindh about the role of radio in opinion-making in rural Pakistan concluded that radio could play an effective role in changing the perception of people about the different issues in Pakistan – besides guiding them to find the



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

solution for their social problems. They claim that the impact multiplies when experts are given the opportunity to debate the local issues in the local language.

Researchers exploring the use of media by different states suggest that they often use propaganda as a tool to convey the message and ensure their strategic interests (Hallin, 1986; Herman and Chomsky, 1988).

Similarly, soon after the 9/11 attacks when US and its allies waged in Afghanistan to counter Al-Qaeda and its operatives, Grad (2009) claims that Western countries started propaganda to win the hearts and minds of the people living in Pakistan and Afghanistan

3. Research Question

This research study aims to answer the following research question:

RQ: What themes (frames) related to the issues of tribal districts were covered by the selected radio stations in their news bulletin?

4.1. Research Methodology

To answer this research questions, the researcher conducted a quantitative content analysis. Content analysis reduces a significant number of textual data into a manageable chunk of information (Weber, 1990, p. 15). Krippendorff (2004) defines content analysis as “a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from data to their context” (p.21).

Weber (1990) argued that content analysis “classifies textual material



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

reducing it to more relevant manageable bits of data” (p.5). There are no universally accepted rules for conducting a content analysis. However, Elo and Kyngäs (2008) contend that every content analysis is conducted in three stages: preparation, organization of the data, and analysis.

The media of interest in this study are the Pashtu language radio stations targeting the ethnically Pashtun population in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The radio stations selected for this study are Deewa Radio (Pashto language services of the Voice of America), Radio Mashaal (Pashto language service of Radio Free Europe), and Radio Pakistan (Pashto services, broadcasting from Peshawar Centre). These radio stations are popular in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa especially in the tribal region of Pakistan, because radio is a primary source of information in this area of Pakistan. People in the recently merged tribal districts rely heavily on these radio stations for their information needs. The selected radio stations included in this study have at least nine hours of broadcasts including hourly news broadcasts. These radio stations also have teams of reporters in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and FATA (Newly merged tribal districts). In the next few paragraphs, the researcher describes these radio stations in detail.

Radio Pakistan is the official radio station of the state of Pakistan. It is known for propagating state policy on different issues. The state-owned



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

radio station is broadcasting its transmission in 32 different languages. Besides local broadcasts (within Pakistan) Radio Pakistan is regularly broadcasting its external transmission for overseas and to propagation. The key aim of Radio Pakistan is to provide information, education and entertainment to the audience. And ensure national unity and promote Islamic ideology in the country. Radio Pakistan broadcast its program in Pashtu language programs from the Peshawar centre. The Peshawar centre is targeting Pashtu-speaking listeners from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and the tribal districts.

Mashaal Radio is the Pushto service of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty. The service was launched on January 15, 2010, to counter the extremist radio stations operating in FATA (RFE/RL, 2010). Mashaal Radio mainly focus on different issues related to Pakistan. The headquarter of Mashaal Radio is in Prague. It has a station in Islamabad and reporting team in Peshawar, FATA, and Baluchistan. Mainly Mashaal Radio depends on freelancers or correspondents. It uses the frequency and transmitter of Voice of America, Deewa Radio.

Deewa Radio is another favourite Pushto language broadcast in FATA and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The service was launched by Voice of America in 2006, to counter extremist narratives in the border areas of



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
Pakistan and province "objective and transparent information" to the Pashtun population of Pakistan and border areas of Afghanistan. They have their headquarters in Washington D.C., and a team of reporters in Islamabad, Peshawar, FATA and other parts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. It also runs talk shows, news bulletins, entertainment programs, etc., for nine hours a day.

4.2. Sampling and Time Frame

News stories aired on the three radio stations between December 20, 2017, to January 20, 2018, during the prime time's hourly news bulleting were selected for analysis in this study. All the bulletins were broadcasted in the Pashtu language. The researcher selected this time frame for the research study because three issues were the top trend in the country in that time period and that was related to the Tribal Districts.

i) Pashtun Tahafuz Movement (PTM)

PTM was a movement started in Waziristan (A Tribal District) for the rights of Pashtuns of Tribal districts and Baluchistan. Later on, they started demonstrations and sit-ins against the government with different slogans for the protection of their rights. The main motive of this movement was to



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

bring peace in the region. The foreign media was also highlighting the issue and this movement.

ii) FATA Merger

The second major trend or topic in this period was the FATA merger. The locals of FATA were demanding for a merger they were rising their voices for quick action on other hand the federal government was busy with legislation for the merger. Different media outlets (local and International) were focused on the merger. They represent the FATA merger in their frames.

iii) End of Militancy and Return of FATA to Normalcy.

In the selected time frame for this research study the Pakistani government and law enforcement agencies declared that peace has been restored in tribal districts of Pakistan, and the chapter of terrorism has been closed.

During the same time period, the transmission of *Mashaal* Radio and later on the service of *Deewa* Radio was suspended in Pakistan. So, it is a suitable time frame to analyse the contents of these radio stations because it will help to analyse and explore that what kind of content was broadcasted by those radio stations.

4.3. Coding Sheet



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

A coding scheme was developed based on the research questions of this study. In the next section, the researcher describes the coding scheme used for coding the stories for the quantitative content analysis to answer the research question.

4.4. Selected news bulletins of the selected radio stations

The researcher selected the following main news bulletins of the three selected radio stations.

Table 4.4.1 Theoretical framework Coverage of themes or frames in the

Name of Radio Station	Name of Selected News Bulletin	<u>Timing</u>
<i>Mashaal Radio</i>	Sahanari Khabroona	4:00 PM (PST)
<i>Deewa Radio</i>	Khabroona	6:00 AM (PST)
<i>Radio Pakistan</i>	Pakhtu Khabrona	5:00 PM (PST).

selected radio stations

5. Theoretical framework

The findings of this research study are informed by the framing theory. Frame theory contains a number of concepts from sociology and communication science. It aims to explain why people focus on certain aspects of reality and not others. The concept and theories of framing were



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
grasped by Erving Goffman (1974) for the field of sociology, and it was this renewed sociological perspective that was used in communication research. Goffman refers to frameworks as social frameworks and mental schemas that allow users to organize experiences. Frame theory aims to identify the patterns in which individuals perceive the world. The roots of “frame theory is often attributed to the sociologist Erving Goffman, who argued that interpretive designs were central to cultural belief systems”.

Framing theory can also motivate its viewers to change their role in solving social and political problems through elected officials. There are two types of media coverage in central research: episodic and thematic. Episodic accounting takes words as one program, where historical records combine events into a series of studies. When viewers are exposed to episodic narratives, they are unable to establish a rational link between the terms (such as crime and poverty) and elected officials or economic realities. In the media when they specifically report on poverty, more than twice may point to the problem as episodic rather than a topic. As a result, viewers blame the poor for the poor, and they do not support the government's efforts to address the problem. People are believed to have a system of looking at the world and interpreting data, which is known as the key. The main framework is of two types: natural and interactive. The

Page | 86



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
genetic process defines physical phenomena, whereas the social system sees them as triggers, acting as a result of behaviours acting let people act deceitfully. These structures help to interpret data as it is organized, but people do not know it (Gavilán, 2011).

6. Findings/ Discussion

This research study looked at the representation of issues in tribal districts in 2017-18 in the three selected radio stations – *Mashaal Radio*, *Deewa Radio* and *Radio Pakistan*. The researcher collected and analysed the news bulletin of these radio stations from 20th December 2017 to 20th January 2018 to understand the nature of their coverage. The researcher initially collected 657 themes from the selected news stories through a coding sheet. The researcher then entered the data into SPSS and merged the different themes together to develop a broader nine themes. The Table 6.1.1 demonstrates the themes discussed by the selected radio stations.

Table: 6.1.1 Coverage of themes or frames in the selected radio stations

Name of Radio Station	Number of themes
<i>Mashaal Radio</i>	299
<i>Deewa Radio</i>	210
<i>Radio Pakistan</i>	148
Total	657



The above findings demonstrate that *Mashaal Radio* has aired 299 different themes about tribal districts followed by the 210 themes debated by the *Voice of America* the broadcasted. Radio Pakistan, on the other hand, only aired 148 different themes in their main news bulletin in the selected time period. These findings reveal that both the foreign radio stations – *Mashaal Radio and Deewa Radio* – covered more themes/frames related to the tribal districts in their main news bulletins than the state-owned radio stations.

Discussing more themes (frames) in the coverage also demonstrates that the selected foreign radio stations were more interested in the issues or events related to the tribal districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa than the state's official broadcaster. It is also visible from the findings that the selected foreign radio stations would have given more time to the issues of tribal districts than the Pakistan's own radio station. It is significant to note that many researchers claim that the basic aim of launching these foreign radio stations was to influence the opinion of people living in tribal districts about the American government and their policies in the region. Thus, we can rightly claim that the selected radio stations have acted on the behalf of the US government to propagate their views. Thus, it becomes more significant



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

now to understand what was the nature of the coverage of the selected radio stations.

6.2. Nature of coverage related to FATA in the introduction of news stories

This section informs the readers about the themes discussed in the introduction of news stories on-aired by *Radio Pakistan, Deewa Radio and Mashaal Radio*. It will help us understand that what the three selected radio stations emphasized in the opening of their news stories related to FATA – to their listeners. Different research studies have highlighted the importance of lead or intro in news stories as it leaves a great impression on the minds of readers or listeners as it highlights something significant. In the field of journalism, it is considered that “intro” or “lead” should be based on the crux of the issue or development. Hence, it will help us know what kind of issues these selected radio stations covered in the introduction of their news stories – related to FATA – and what they ignored. To understand the nature of coverage better, the researcher has broadly categorized the data into eight major themes. It includes discussion about the failure of Pakistan to counterterrorism, Pakistani govt measures to defeat terrorism, Reforms introduced by Pakistan in FATA, criticism on Pakistan for not doing enough for Fata, USA criticizing Pakistan, Pakistan criticizing the USA, discussion



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
 on political issues and visits, and relations of Pakistan with neighbouring countries. These themes are on-aired from the three selected radio stations.

The finding can be seen below in Table 6.2.1

Table:6.2.1 Main Theme discussed in the introduction of the news story

Main Theme discussed in the introduction of news story				
Themes	Name of Radio Station			TOTAL
	<i>Mashaal Radio</i>	<i>Deewa Radio</i>	<i>Radio Pakistan</i>	
Superficial discussion about the terrorist events in tribal areas/ other parts of Pakistan discussed in the context of tribal districts.	9 8%	20 22%	15 19%	44
Discussion about the measures taken by the Pakistani Government/ military to defeat terrorists/ terrorism in FATA/Pakistan	10 9%	9 10%	33 42%	52
Discussion about the reforms introduced by the Pakistani govt/military in FATA.	17 15%	6 7%	4 5%	27
Criticism on Pakistani government for not doing enough for FATA	31 27%	10 11%	0 0%	41



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

Criticism on Pakistani govt/military by USA govt/officials for not doing enough in war on terror	9 8%	18 20%	0 0%	27
Criticism on US govt/officials by Pakistani govt/officials for not doing enough for them.	4 3.5%	5 5.5%	1 1.5%	10
Discussion about routine political issues of Pakistan/Official visits to tribal districts	19 17%	11 12%	14 18%	44
Discussion about the relationship of Pakistan with Afghanistan/India/China	6 5%	5 5.5%	4 5%	15
Any Other	9 8%	6 6.5%	7 9%	22
Total	114 100%	90 100%	78 100%	282

The above findings demonstrate that Mashaal Radio gave balanced coverage to the tribal districts in its news bulletins. On one hand, they did



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

inform the listeners about the issues in FATA and stayed critical of the Pakistani government and its institutions by criticizing their policies and actions in tribal districts. However, on the other hand, they did appreciate the stand of the Pakistani government and its institutions by emphasizing it enough in their coverage.

If we explore the data collected from the Mashaal Radio it is evident that more than one-fourth, 27% of the overall coverage, revolved around the criticism of the Pakistani government and institutions for not doing enough for the people of tribal districts. On the other hand, the criticism levelled by the US government and its institutions on the Pakistani government stood at 8% of the entire coverage. Thus, if we add the above two themes, then it demonstrates that together it makes 35% of the entire coverage – which is more than one-third of the whole coverage. If we look at these two themes independently then it seems that they came hard and harsh on Pakistan – but we need to look into the other themes too to see the holistic picture of the coverage.

While looking into the other themes, it is clear that Mashaal Radio also tried to highlight the Pakistani government's point of view in the coverage by giving space to it as 17% of their coverage focused on the officials' visits to tribal districts to carry out routine activities. The reforms introduced by the



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

Pakistani government in the tribal districts also made 15% of the entire coverage. Likewise, the measures taken by the Pakistani government/military to defeat terrorists in the tribal districts made 9% of the coverage. Thus, if we accumulate these three themes – supporting of Pakistani government's stand – it makes 41% of the entire coverage, which is more than 35% of the criticism of Pakistan.

Additionally, the data also demonstrates that 3.5% of the coverage of Mashaal Radio also focused on the criticism of the policies of US government and its supportive institutions by the Pakistani government and its institutions. Indeed, the US government's criticism of Pakistani government stood 8% of the whole coverage by asking the government to 'do more' or stop supporting terrorists or even asking them to wipe them out from a region. Indeed, the US government was favoured over the Pakistani government – but they also did not turn away their face from the Pakistani point of view.

In an earlier discussion, it was revealed that Mashaal Radio was launched by the US government to propagate their views to the people of Afghanistan and tribal districts – but the findings here suggest a different picture. The findings confirm that they equally criticized the US government and its policies in the region. Giving space to the sources – supportive of the



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

Pakistani government or independent enough to criticize the US government in the news coverage – leaves an impression that the reporters or correspondents working in different parts of Pakistan including tribal areas have tried to perform their duties more professionally and tactfully by finding the middle ground in the issues.

It is true that Mashaal Radio was blacklisted in Pakistan and its website was banned in Pakistan for promoting the anti-Pakistan narratives in their coverage. However, the findings – based on the exploration of news bulletins of one-month data ranging from December 2017 to January 2018 – suggest that they gave balanced coverage to the tribal districts and their issues by criticizing Pakistan and its institutions, but then also supporting them by highlighting their point of view or their actions or policies.

The findings, based on the coverage of Deewa Radio, in their news bulletins, suggest that they stood critical of the Pakistani government and its institutions – compared to the coverage of Mashaal Radio. The data reveals that 31% of the entire coverage of Deewa Radio was based on the criticism of Pakistani government and its institutions. It is significant to mention that 20% of the coverage of themes was based on the criticism on Pakistani government and its institutions by the US government and its officials; while 11% emphasized that Pakistani government was not doing enough for



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

tribal districts and its people. This criticism almost makes the one-third of the entire coverage.

On the other hand, the data demonstrates that 22.5% of the coverage of Deewa Radio was supportive of the Pakistani stance and their actions as 10% of the coverage revolved around the measures taken by the Pakistani government to defeat terrorism in the tribal districts; 7% of themes focused on the reforms introduced by the Pakistani government officials in FATA; while 5.5% of the discussion of themes focused on the criticism of US government by the Pakistani government or its officials. It was earlier noticed that Mashaal Radio was more supportive of Pakistan as they highlighted their point of view and their efforts more in the coverage than criticizing them – but the findings, based on the news coverage of Deewa Radio, suggest that it stood critical of the Pakistani government and its institutions.

The findings suggest that it might reflect the calculated policy of US government where they appreciated the Pakistani government and its institutions on one radio station – but then criticized them more on the other. They might have played a bluff with the listeners too by making them believe that they are neutral or trying to figure out the issue independently.



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

But the data reveals that these two radio stations made the listeners busy in different ways and through different techniques.

The coverage of Radio Pakistan, the official broadcaster of Pakistan, suggests that they supported the policies and measures of the government of Pakistan in the tribal districts. Their controlled coverage of the tribal districts is evident from the findings as 60% of its coverage revolved around the measures taken by the Pakistani government/ military to defeat terrorism or terrorists in tribal districts or Pakistan (42%) – coupled with the discussion about the routine political issues of Pakistan or official visits of high-ups to the tribal districts (18%). The findings also suggest that 19% of the coverage of Radio Pakistan also emphasizes the superficial discussion about the terrorist events in FATA. Thus, it clearly demonstrates that most of the coverage of Radio Pakistan, almost 80% of their entire coverage, focused on superficial supporting themes. This shows that the triangle of the coverage was that initially, they reported the events to the listeners and then they built on the event by emphasizing the measures taken by the Pakistani military/ government's administration to cope with the situation. Meanwhile, the official visits of government high-ups were also covered as a routine. This implies that Radio Pakistan was much tactful in its coverage



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

and was also supportive of the official line in their coverage of tribal districts.

On the other hand, the findings also demonstrate that Radio Pakistan did not highlight the criticism of Pakistani government and its institutions by US or any others as it made 0% of the entire coverage. On the other hand, the criticism by the Pakistani government and its institutions on the US government stood only 1.5% of the entire coverage. This demonstrates that Radio Pakistan very tactfully avoided criticizing the strategic partners in the War on Terror. It is true that Radio Pakistan cannot afford the criticism on the Pakistani government due to its reliance on the government of Pakistan for its financial assistance and policies. Earlier, different research scholars claimed that Radio Pakistan acts as a mouthpiece of the ruling government and these findings confirm this claim too as they did not struggle to criticize them.

Tribal areas remain of the volatile regions of Pakistan that has attracted the attention of the world due to the events that disturbed the peace and stability in the region. The data shows that after 9/11 five major military operations have taken place in the tribal districts and it resulted in the death and casualties of many tribal persons – including security officials. The financial, social and cultural cost of the radicalization and counter-



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
radicalization strategies in tribal districts is much higher too as it resulted in the drop of businesses there and displacement of local tribal families. Thus, measures taken by the federal or provincial government to improve this volatile region indeed deserved attention and thorough discussion – from the tribal areas’ perspective. But the findings suggest that except Mashaal Radio that tried to keep the balance in their narratives, the other two radio stations, Radio Pakistan and Deewa Radio stuck to their official policy and propagated it to their audience.

6.3. Nature of coverage given to the tribal districts in the body of news stories

This section deliberates the first two additional themes (other than the introduction) discussed in the body of news stories of *Radio Pakistan, Deewa Radio and Mashaal Radio*. It will help us understand what they emphasized to their listeners in their primetime news bulletins. The researcher earlier explained and debated the themes discussed in the introduction of news stories – but here the researcher will highlight the data related to the first two additional themes discussed in the body of a new story. There is a possibility that the selected radio stations, in their news bulletins, might have started the news stories with one theme but then they might have started discussing other themes in the stories. Therefore, the
Page | 98



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

researcher wants to investigate what they emphasized and also ignored in the body of news stories – related to the tribal districts.

To have more holistic picture of the coverage, the researcher again recoded or merged the different collected themes into eight broader themes mentioned in the Table below. The data would help us understand the nature of coverage given by the selected radio stations to the issues of tribal districts in the body of their news stories.

The findings are presented below in Table 6.3.1



Table:6.3.1 Additional themes discussed in the body of news stories

Additional Themes	Name of Radio Station			TOTAL
	Mashaal Radio	VOA, Deewa	Radio Pakistan	
Discussion about the failure of Pakistani Govt/military to wipe out terrorists/terrorism in FATA/Pakistan/Afghan Border	20 11%	19 16%	8 11%	47
Discussion about the measures taken by the Pakistani Government/military to defect terrorists/terrorism in FATA/Pakistan	18 10%	18 15%	27 38.5%	63
Discussion about the reforms introduced by the Pakistani govt/military in FATA.	23 12%	6 5%	20 25.5%	49
Criticism on Pakistani government for not doing enough for FATA	49 26.5%	11 9%	4 6%	64
Criticism on Pakistani govt/military by USA govt/officials for not doing enough in war on terror	17 9%	30 25%	0 0%	47
Criticism on US govt/officials by Pakistani govt/officials for not doing enough for them.	8 4%	10 8%	0 0%	18
Discussion about routine political issues of Pakistan/Officials	28 15%	13 11%	5 7%	46



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

Discussion about relationship of Pakistan with Afghanistan/India/China	14 8%	4 3%	2 3%	20
Any Other	8 4%	9 7.5%	4 5.5%	21
Total	185 100%	120 100%	70 100%	375

The above findings demonstrate that Mashaal Radio covered a greater number of themes in their news coverage of tribal districts, followed by Deewa Radio and Radio Pakistan. The basic reason behind this massive coverage of themes also lies in the coverage of overall a greater number of news stories by Mashaal Radio.

The greater number of themes covered by the Mashaal Radio also reflects that they tried to inform and educate the readers more about the issues related to the tribal districts in a more diverse way compared to the other two selected radio stations. It is now significant to understand the nature of coverage given by the selected radio stations.

If we look at the findings, placed in Table 6.3 above, it demonstrates that more than one-fourth, 26.5%, of the coverage of Mashaal Radio revolved around the criticism on Pakistani government for not doing enough



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
for FATA, followed by the discussion surrounding the routine political visits of Pakistani officials (15%), and reforms introduced by the Pakistani government and military in FATA 12%. It is significant to mention here that earlier researchers found that Mashaal Radio tried to keep itself away from controversies by informing the readers, in the introduction of their news stories, in a way that favoured the Pakistani government. However, the findings are highly significant here as it reveals that they debated the failure of Pakistani government more than any other themes in the body of the news stories. It implies that they tried to win the confidence of their listeners, by giving them an impression that they are looking at the issue/ event related to the tribal districts neutrally – but later on they built the story with their critical narratives.

If we regroup the few selected themes in Table above, it also demonstrates that overall coverage of Mashaal Radio was also critical of Pakistani government and its institutions. Combining the three themes in the coverage including discussion about the failure of Pakistani government/ military to wipe out terrorism or terrorists in the tribals districts, criticism on Pakistani government for not doing enough for the people of tribal districts, and criticism on Pakistani government by US government for not doing enough in the War on Terror accumulatively made 46.5% of the entire
Page | **102**



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
coverage, and that it is approximately equal to the half of the entire discussion of themes.

Regrouping the other themes, supportive of the Pakistani government, in the coverage of Mashaal Radio, clearly demonstrates that it made 26% of the entire coverage – based on the discussion of themes surrounding the reforms introduced by the Pakistani government/ military in the tribal districts (12%), discussion about the measures taken by the Pakistani government/ military in the tribal districts to defeat terrorism or terrorists in the region (10%), and criticism on US government by the Pakistani government/ military for not doing enough for them that stood 4%.

The findings reveal that most of the coverage of Mashaal Radio, in the body of news stories, stood critical of Pakistani government and its military, and they bashed them much in their coverage. The researcher understands that Mashaal Radio's website was blocked by the Pakistan Telecommunication Authority on the directives of the Pakistani military for propagating negative views about the Pakistani government and military. The data also suggests that it did not accommodate the Pakistani government and military's point of view much in their coverage than criticizing them. It is also true that they too accommodated their point of

Page | **103**



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
view in their coverage and did criticize the US government too in the coverage. On the other hand, the neutral themes including the visits of Pakistani officials to the tribal districts or discussions about the relations of Pakistan with neighbouring countries were also highlighted in the coverage.

The findings of Deewa Radio, based on the discussion of two additional themes in the body of a news story, reveal that most of its coverage revolved around the criticism of Pakistani government and its institutions for not doing enough for the tribal districts, its people and also War on Terror. The data supports that 50% of the entire coverage of Deewa Radio revolved around critical themes that includes criticism on Pakistani government and its military by US for not doing enough in the War on Terror (25%), discussion about the failure of Pakistani government and its institution to wipe out the terrorism and terrorists in tribal districts, Pakistan and border areas (16%), and criticism on Pakistani government for not doing enough for tribal districts (9%). It clearly demonstrates that the coverage of Deewa Radio was also critical of the Pakistani government and its institutions in their role in the ongoing War on Terror and also defeating terrorism and terrorists in the region.

It was earlier found that Deewa Radio stood equally critical of the Pakistani government and its military in the introduction of the news stories,
Page | **104**



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

but the date here also reinforces that the same trend has been continued and they have been bashed intensely in the body of stories too. Interestingly, the data reveals that Deewa Radio was more critical of the Pakistani government and its military than the other two radio stations – based on the data of the introduction and body of news stories.

It is more significant to note that Deewa Radio criticized the Pakistani government and its military in a highly tactful way by slightly appreciating Pakistan's role, in the policies and actions related to the tribal districts, to look impartial and unbiased. Interestingly, the data reveals that 28% of the coverage of Dewaa Radio also favoured Pakistan and that includes discussion about the measures taken by the Pakistani government and its military to defeat terrorism, or terrorists in the tribal districts, Pakistan and bordering areas (15%), discussion about the reforms introduced by the Pakistani government and military in the tribal districts (5%) and criticism on the role of US government and officials by the Pakistani officials (8%). Thus, it shows that they too highlighted the Pakistani government's point of view in their coverage to stay safe – given the circumstances that their reporters were covering the events and issues from the tribal and settled districts of Pakistan.



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

The nature of coverage of Radio Pakistan reveals that almost two-thirds of the entire coverage, 64%, revolved around the supporting themes of Pakistani government. It includes 38.5% of the discussion on measures taken by the Pakistani government and military to defeat terrorism and terrorists in the tribal districts and Pakistan followed by 25.5% of the discussion reflecting the reforms introduced by the Pakistani government and military in the tribal districts. Interestingly, the Radio Pakistan also emphasized the failure of the Pakistani government and military to wipe out terrorism in Pakistan and in the tribal districts as it stood 11% of the entire coverage followed by the discussion that Pakistani government is not doing enough for the people of tribal districts that stood 6% of the whole coverage.

The above findings reflect that Radio Pakistan propagated the narratives of the Pakistani government and its institutions and performed their role as their mouthpiece. However, they also levelled criticism on the government as no one would have even expected the Radio Pakistan to criticize them. But the criticism levelled by them was of less quantity and it cannot be taken as a paradigm shift in the policy of Radio Pakistan. Like the two other selected radio stations – Mashaal Radio and Deewa Radio – they also criticized their own government to look impartial and independent.



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

The findings of the three selected radio stations demonstrate that they almost adopted the same approach in their news bulletins by criticizing bit their own respective government, but then levelling heavy criticism on the opponents or defending their owners. On one hand, if such coverage has deprived the people of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and tribal districts of the impartial and independent coverage of their issues on popular radio stations. On the other hand, they have also explored these issues with their biases and wishful frame. Mass media is considered an institution that helps people know and understand the issues in the public domain to have an intelligent and rational opinion about their issues. But such coverage, based on the illogical and biased views of the reporters and different sources of it, undermines such efforts and only fulfils the objectives of the radio stations.

Conclusion

The basic aim of this research study was to explore the representation of Issues in Tribal Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in Mashaal Radio, Radio Pakistan and Deewa Radio. Every media organization follows its agenda and gatekeeping process for the selection and framing of different news items. The findings confirmed that Mashaal Radio broadcasted a greater number of news stories regarding the representation of different issues of tribal districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of
than the other two radio stations. The data, related to the themes discussed in the introduction of news stories, revealed that Mashaal Radio tried to present the Pakistani government and its institutions, in the context of issues of tribal districts, in a balanced way. Both foreign radio stations supported the narrative of the USA in the context of terrorism, on the other hand, Radio Pakistan was also supportive of the Pakistani government and its institutions.

References

- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 62(1), 107-115.
- Forde, D. S., Foxwell, M. K., & Meadows, M. (2001). Commitment To Community: Results From A National Survey Of the Community Radio Sector. Paper presented at the Australian Broadcasting Authority Conference 'Radio, Television and the New Media' Canberra
- FRC. (2019). Illegal FM Radio Stations in Fata and KPK. Retrieved from <https://frc.org.pk/commentaries/illegal-fm-radio-stations-in-fata-and-kpk/>
- Hallin, D. (1986). *The Uncensored War: The Media and Vietnam*. New York : Oxford University Press .
- Jumani, D. N. B., & Fazal-ur-Rahman. (2009). ROLE OF MEDIA (RADIO) IN OPINION BUILDING IN RURAL MASSES IN PAKISTAN. *Globe Media Journal* 2(2).
- K.Venkatalakshmi, & R.Chandraleka. (2013). A Study On Social Initiative Activities Given By FM Radio Stations *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL*



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

OF INNOVATIVE RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT, 2(5). Retrieved from www.ijird.com

Krippendorff, K. (2004). Reliability in content analysis: Some common misconceptions and recommendations. *Human communication research*, 30(3), 411-433.

Madamombe, I. (2005). Community radio: a voice for the poor. Retrieved from <http://www.un.org/africarenewal/magazine/july-2005/community-radio-voice-poor>

Ocwich, D. (2006). FM Radios and Rural Development

Paul, S. (2022). Young Listeners Turn Off Broadcast, Tune Into Internet Radio [STUDY]. Retrieved from

<http://mashable.com/2022/05/15/internet-radio-social-media/>

PEMRA. (2020). List of commercial and non commercial fm radio station licences. Retrieved from <http://www.pemra.gov.pk/>

PEMRA. (2021, March). FM Radio. Retrieved from Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority: <https://pemra.gov.pk/fm.php>

Pentzold, C., & Fischer, C. (2017). Framing Big Data: The discursive construction of a radio cell query in Germany. *Big Data Society*, 4(2), 2053951717745897.

Radio Free Europe/ Radio Liberty, 2002. RFE/RL Begins Broadcasting to Afghanistan. Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, 30 January 2002 [cited 10 June 2021]. Available from <http://www.rferl.org/content/pressrelease/1105533.html>.

Radio Free Europe/ Radio Liberty, 2003. RFE/RL Preparing to Cease Broadcasting in Seven European Languages [Internet]. Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, 28 November 2003 [cited 5 June 2021]. Available from <http://www.rferl.org/content/pressrelease/1105666.html>.

Saeed, M., & Ullah, R. (2021). Exploring News Media Usage Among University Students to Fulfil Needs: Uses & Gratification Perspective. *Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences*, 1(2), 27-39.

Shah, S. F. A., Ginossar, T., & Weiss, D. (2019). "This is a Pakhtun disease": Pakhtun health journalists' perceptions of the barriers and facilitators to polio vaccine acceptance among the high-risk Pakhtun community in Pakistan. *Vaccine*.

Sproule, J. M. (1997). *Propaganda and Democracy: The American Experience of Media and Mass Persuasion*. New York : Cambridge University Press.



Pak. Journal of Media Science, Vol 3, Issue 2 (2022) Representation of Issue of

- Staples, J. (1998). CALL-IN TALK RADIO:A USES AND GRATIFICATIONS STUDY OF LISTENERS, NONLISTENERS, AND CALLERS (Master of Arts in Communication). University of Delaware,
- Ullah, R. (2017). Role of FM Radio in Education (A Case Study of FM Radio in Peshawar). TEXTROAD Publishing Corporation .
- Ullah, R. (2017). Role of FM Radio in News and information: A Study of FM Radios in Peshawar. Paper presented at the 3rd Multi Disciplinary Student Research Conference (MDSRC), University of Wah, Pakistan.
- Ullah, R. (2018). ROLE OF FM RADIOS IN NEWS AND INFORMATION: A STUDY OF FM RADIOS IN PESHAWAR, KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. International Journal of Communication Research, 8(2), 144-152.
- Ullah, R., & Baber, D. (2017). Role of FM Radios in Entertainment: A Study of FM Radios in Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Paper presented at the National Conference on” Media in Post-Modern Times: Challenges & Prospects”, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.
- Ullah, R., & Baber, D. (2018). Role of FM Radio in the Promotion of China Pakistan
- Ullah, R., & Khan, A., Ullah,. (2017). Role of FM Radio in Education (A Case Study of FM Radio in Peshawar). Journal of Social Sciences and Humanity Studies (JSSHS), 3(3(3)9-16, 2017), 9-16.
- Ullah, R., Baber, D., & Rehman, A. u. (2020). ROLE OF FM RADIO IN THE PROMOTION OF CHINA PAKISTAN ECONOMIC CORRIDOR (CPEC). Journal of Research Reviews in Social Sciences Pakistan, 3(2), 972-981.
- Weber, R. P. (1990). Basic content analysis (Vol. 49). Sage.
- Weldon, J.O, 1988. ‘The early history of US international broadcasting for the start of World War II’. IEEE Broadcast Technology Society Journal. vol. 34, no. 2 (June 1988).